

Christ, but it does not require awareness of this fact for such faith to be genuine. O'C. proposes four criteria for discerning authentic religious experiences: their profundity, their ability to inspire hope and love, their christological character, and their trinitarian face.

While in previous works O'C. often focused on defending other theologians, mainly Jacques Dupuis, against accusers, he here outlines his own position as distinct from Dupuis, Rahner, Griffiths, D'Costa, and so on. As the title of the book indicates, his approach is firmly christocentric. It is not entirely clear, however, how this approach resolves the stalemate in the classical debates surrounding Christian theology of religions. It would seem to represent a typical form of inclusivism, with even greater emphasis on the exclusive mediatory role of Jesus Christ. This is an entirely coherent Christian position, but it does not as such offer a real alternative to previous positions. One of the riches of a Christian theology of religions is the flexibility and dynamism offered by its trinitarian theological presupposition, which risks being occluded by moving to the terminology of a Christology of religions.

Like O'C., I have argued for the need to pay greater attention to the question of revelation or truth in Christian theology of religions. O'C. also cites my article in Merrigan's and Friday's book (*The Past, Present and Future of Theologies of Interreligious Dialogue*). The criteria he proposes for discerning truth in other religions may be important and valid, but do not acknowledge the difficulty of developing stable criteria from within Christianity (or any other religion) or the challenges of applying these criteria to concrete cases. His own quick and superficial application of the criterion of "Trinitarian fact" to the Hindu Trimurti, or the Daoist "Yin, Yang and Tao" (136) illustrates the challenge.

Though its foray into the teachings of other religions may be found wanting, this volume brings out several new and important points of discussion for Christian theology of religions. In particular, I found his discussion of prayers of intercession to be both theologically enriching and personally inspiring. The book is an important reflection of the insights of a theologian whose consistent concern has been to establish a theological foundation for the possibility of salvation for all.

Catherine Cornille
Boston College

Christologie und Kommunion: Entstehung und Verbreitung der homoousianischen Christologie. By Vladimir Latinovic. Vol. I. Münster: Aschendorf, 2018. Pp. Xiii + 256. €33.

When Vladimir Latinovic, an Orthodox Serbian-born doctoral student at the University of Tübingen, proposed to write his dissertation on Christology, we are told, a "famous Tübingen theology professor"—whose name shall remain hidden—asked him, skeptically, if he was sure he could say anything new in this field (1). I am glad that the proverbially quasi-infallible German professor has been proved

wrong, and badly. Not only has L. said quite a few things new but he also has forced church historians, systematic theologians, and liturgists to question the customary narrative about the Asian controversy. True to form, L.'s German-university dissertation runs to over a thousand pages, and this book represents only the first of three projected volumes.

What drives L.'s overall christological research is this rather unconventional question: What is the cause of the diminution of the frequency in the faithful's reception of the Eucharist in Christian late antiquity? His answer, bound to raise theological eyebrows, is the affirmation of Christ's divinity from Nicea to Chalcedon. As a result of this dogma, the lay faithful began *fearing* the body and blood of Christ and stopped *receiving* it and instead *adored* it, a practice that became prevalent in the Middle Ages.

To support this thesis, L. undertook thorough research into and reinterpretation of the Christologies of the early church. This consisted in a comparative study of key late antique theologians, and the five chapters of the book do precisely this. In L.'s reading, there was a gradual shifting from a Christology "from below" to a Christology "from above," in which the belief in Jesus's "subordination" to the Father, which was at first the mainstream, "conservative," and "orthodox" position, transformed to the (over)emphasis on his divinity, encapsulated in the *homousios* term. L. traces this development in four stages, represented by controversies among paradigmatic theologians. The first phase began with Arius, Alexander, and Athanasius and culminated in the Council of Nicea in 325 (chap. 1); the second with Diodorus and Apollonaris and culminated in the Council of Constantinople in 381 (chap. 2); the third with Cyril and Nestorius and reached its climax in the Council of Ephesus in 431 (chap. 3); and the fourth with Theodoret, Eutyches, and Dioscurus and ended in the Council of Chalcedon (chap. 4). The last chapter examines the paradoxes in the Chalcedonian Definition of *asynchutos* and *achoristos*, of *mia* and *duo*. (Those not having time to read the entire book can peruse the very helpful *Überblick*, 163–73.)

L.'s account of early patristic and conciliar Christology is a highly original and well-documented alternative to the well-worn version endlessly repeated in manuals of church history and the history of dogma. His retrieval of early "subordinationism" is a timely corrective to monophysitism, which is more widespread among the theologically uninitiated than commonly assumed. Most importantly, L. persuasively demonstrates the correlation between the dogmatic affirmation of the divinity of Jesus and the gradual decrease in reception of the Eucharist, thus providing a clear instance of the *lex credendi/lex orandi*, which should worry pastoral leaders concerning sacramental practice. In this way, L. corrects and completes the work of Josef A. Jungman. On this impact of *homousios* on liturgy and popular piety, we eagerly look forward to the second and third volumes of L.'s magnum opus. With the publication of his trilogy, L. will have established himself as one of the most creative among the cohort of younger theologians in Europe. In the meantime, since not many can read German, an English translation of this first volume would be highly recommended.

Peter C. Phan
Georgetown University

The Holy Spirit: Setting the World on Fire. Edited by Richard Lennan and Nancy Pineda-Madrid. New York: Paulist, 2017. Pp. xvii + 230. \$29.95.

In the body of Christ, many distinct members are animated by one Spirit (1 Cor 12). This Pauline theology is a theme of several chapters in this volume and is also manifest in the very composition of the book. The anthology is a collaboration of sixteen faculty members of Boston College's School of Theology and Ministry, each of whom has contributed their distinct gifts in biblical, liturgical, historical, systematic, moral, and pastoral theology to the endeavor. The collegial character of the project and careful editing have produced an anthology that is not just a series of chapters on a common subject but an integrated volume of complementary essays in which the authors cross-reference one another's work.

Editors Richard Lennan and Nancy Pineda-Madrid envisioned the book as a reflection on the relationship between the Holy Spirit and the church as a community of disciples commissioned to set the world afire with God's love. The volume is structured in three sections. Part 1 is entitled "Experiencing the Holy Spirit" and includes essays on the eucharistic liturgy, deification, materiality and saintly relics, pilgrimage, and the nearness of the Spirit of a transcendent God whose intimate indwelling has demonstrable effects. Part 2 charts the movement of the Spirit through tracings evident in the Old and New Testaments, the early church, the middle ages, and the lives of the sixteenth-century saints Teresa of Avila and Ignatius of Loyola. Part 3 on "Embracing the Spirit" offers reflections on the life of Óscar Romero, the charisms of religious institutes and ecclesial movements, the Catholic Charismatic Movement and Hispanic Catholic parishes, the spiritual development and formation of adolescents, emotions and the moral life, and the articulation and disruption of meaningful narratives.

There are many strengths to the well-written essays in this volume. Colleen Griffith and others emphasize that the Holy Spirit enlivens not only human persons but all of creation and that the work of the Spirit is inseparably both personal and corporate. Andrew Davis and Angela Kim Harkins attend to the multivalence of language as they use sources from Scripture and Second Temple Judaism to enrich our understanding of a Christian theology of the Holy Spirit without conflating Christianity and Judaism. Hosffman Ospino draws our attention to the importance of Hispanic Catholics in the future of the US Catholic Church and the contribution of apostolic movements, from the Catholic Charismatic Renewal to the New Evangelization. Theresa O'Keefe integrates developmental psychology with theology in ways that can strengthen pastoral ministry with adolescents and young adults. A number of the essays grapple constructively with the perennial challenge of the discernment of the Holy Spirit within the messiness and complexity of human history. Authors highlight the dangers of egoisms and idolatries, the need for ascetical practices, and the importance of careful discernment of the Holy